



Agenda Report

22-237

Agenda Date: 3/3/2022

REPORT TO HISTORICAL AND LANDMARKS COMMISSION

SUBJECT

Consideration of Historic Preservation Agreement (Mills Act Contract) and Significant Property Alteration (SPA) Permit to allow a new basement, first floor addition, and new detached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) and garage at 1765 Market Street

BACKGROUND

The subject property is listed as a historic resource on the City's Historic Resource Inventory (HRI). The project is before the Historical and Landmarks Commission (HLC) for a recommendation to the Director of Community Development for the significant property alteration of a historic structure and to the City Council for approval of the Mills Act Contract application, including the adoption of a 10-Year Rehabilitation and Maintenance Plan.

The project includes construction of a new basement and rear addition to an existing one-story residence to expand from three-bedrooms with one and a half bathrooms to five-bedrooms and four full bathrooms. The project also includes a Variance request for building height to allow the demolition of an existing detached garage and construction of a new detached, two-story Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) over a two-car garage. The Variance request will be considered separately by the Planning Commission and Architectural Review Approval will be considered by the Development Review Hearing, subsequently.

DISCUSSION

The subject property contains a three-bedroom and one and a half bathroom, one-story house of Queen Anne style architecture built between 1900-1905. An updated historical survey (DPR form 523A) was prepared by William Kostura in March, 2021. The property owners, Chris and Heidi Pfaffroth are requesting approval of a Historic Preservation Agreement (Mills Act Contract) for the property including the adoption of a 10-Year Rehabilitation and Maintenance Plan associated with this historic preservation agreement.

The owner's proposed 10-Year Rehabilitation and Maintenance Plan is attached to this report. Some of the notable work that would be performed under this Plan include replacement of the house foundation, replace and upgrade the asphalt composition shingle, repair and restoration of the existing historic wood windows, restore entry porch with replacement of modern material for Douglas fir wood decking and wood railing, and repaint entire exterior of residence.

The proposed development plans are attached at the end of this report. The project scope includes the demolition of a previous rear addition, evaluated as non-character defining, and construction of a 122 square foot first-floor rear addition. Interior remodel scope includes a replacement of two first-floor bedrooms, powder room, kitchen, and side foyer for a new open kitchen master bedroom, laundry room, and interior access to the new basement. Existing basement will be converted into a

new 1,374 square foot of living area for three bedrooms, two full-bathrooms, and a laundry room.

The proposal also includes the demolition of the existing detached 615 square foot garage and construction of a new detached two-story 933 square foot ADU over a two-car garage. The new detached ADU and garage will be located five feet from the east side property line and five feet from the rear property line. The proposed detached two-story ADU height of 22-feet, 3-inches exceeds the maximum allowed height of 16 feet, which requires approval of a Variance by the Planning Commission.. The applicant's Variance justification letter is attached to this report for reference.

The new addition and the entire house will be kept at the existing height elevation above grade and placed above a new full basement addition and foundation. Both the addition and interior alteration would modify the previous rear additions as noted in the DPR. All three previous additions do not have contributing features. The proposed rear addition will preserve the form and prominent hipped peak of original roof form. Historical character of the main house is differentiated by detailing, materials, and form.

The project plans include a preservation treatment plan on Sheet HP1 of the development plan to guide the property owner and contractors in the proper techniques for construction of the addition according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards (SIS) for Rehabilitation. For the proposed work, the applicant has commissioned an additional Secretary of the Interior's evaluation, prepared by Leslie A. G. Dill of Archives & Architecture LLC, dated October 29, 2021. The SIS evaluation concludes that the proposed project meets with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties - Rehabilitation Standards. The evaluation found that the proposed project preserves the historic integrity of the property and conveys an authentic 1900s architectural style, with methods and materials of construction.

Conclusions

Staff finds that the work proposed under the 10-Year Restoration and Maintenance Plan adheres to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and will need to be submitted for Secretary of the Interior's Standards Review and incorporated into the Preservation Treatment plan as necessary. Given the age, historic integrity, and the proposed 10-Restoration and Maintenance Plan, staff supports a Mills Act Preservation Agreement for the property. A copy of the draft contract is also attached to this report.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The proposed project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per CEQA Guidelines Section 15301 - Existing Facilities, in that the project involves the repairs and alterations to a historic single-family residence.

PUBLIC CONTACT

On February 18, 2022, a notice of public hearing of this item was posted in three conspicuous locations within 300 feet of the project site and mailed to property owners within 300 feet of the project site. The applicant provided three support letters from nearby neighbors.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the Historical and Landmarks Commission find that the house will retain sufficient integrity as a significant example of Queen Anne style architecture through the construction of the proposed addition, subject to the procedures outlined in the Preservation Treatment Plan attached to

the Development Plans, and recommend approval of the following:

- 1) That, based upon the analysis and findings of the historical evaluation, the Commission forward a recommendation to the City Council for approval of the Mills Act Contract application, including the adoption of a 10-Year Rehabilitation and Maintenance Plan associated with this historic preservation agreement; and,
- 2) That, based upon the analysis and findings of the historical evaluation, the Commission forward a recommendation of approval for issuance of a Significant Property Alteration (SPA) Permit to the Director of Community Development for the proposed addition, subject to the procedures outlined in the Preservation Treatment Plan attached to the Development Plans.

Prepared by: Steve Le, Assistant Planner

Approved by: Lesley Xavier, Planning Manager

ATTACHMENTS

1. Historical Survey (DPR 523A)
2. Draft Historic Preservation Agreement (Mills Act Contract)
3. Legal Property Description
4. Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation
5. 10-Year Restoration and Maintenance Plan
6. SIS Evaluation
7. Variance Justification Letter
8. Development Plans
9. Letter of Support from 1775 Market Street
10. Letter of Support from 1754 Santa Clara Street
11. Letter of Support form 1742 and 1736 Santa Clara Street