

Beyond Buildings

LORIE A. GARCIA

HISTORIAN

Specializing in Historic Reports

HISTORIC RESOURCES DESIGN REVIEW

1037 Harrison Street, Santa Clara, CA 95050

September 13, 2021

INTRODUCTION:

Executive Summary

Report Intent

Lorie Garcia (Beyond Buildings) was retained by Tom Chan, to conduct a Historic Resources Design Review of his proposed rehabilitation project at 1037 Harrison Street, Santa Clara, California. Ms. Garcia was asked to review the exterior elevations, plans and site plan of the project to determine if the proposed project is in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* (Standards). The Standards are understood to be the prevailing set of guidelines for the review of historic buildings and are used by many communities during the environmental review process to determine the potential impact of a project on an identified historic resource.

Qualifications

Lorie Garcia (BS, Paleontology, San Francisco State) - (Post Graduate work, History/Anthropology/Sociology, Santa Clara University) is a historian and the principal of Beyond Buildings. She has over 35 years' experience as a researcher and in preparing historic surveys and evaluation reports for property owners, cities and government agencies. She has guest lectured on Historic Preservation, Historic Research and Preservation Planning at both San Jose State University and Santa Clara University and on various aspects of California history at numerous public meetings. She has served as a Historic Landmarks Commissioner for both the County and City of Santa Clara and is currently an advisor to the City of Santa Clara's Landmarks Commission. She is the City Historian for the City of Santa Clara. Among the recognition she has received for her work in Preservation and Preservation Planning, is a State of California, Governor's Award for Historic Preservation in 2010. Ms. Garcia, a published author of local history and has written numerous articles on California history. Based on the level of her education and experience, Ms. Garcia qualifies as a historian under the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualification Standards (as defined in 36 CFR Part 61).

Review Methodology

For this report, Lorie Garcia reviewed the Summer 1979, Historic American Building Survey (HABS NO. CA-2063) on the Harrison Street Block and the Historic Resources Survey Report for the "Harrison Street Block," dated September 22, 1980. Ms. Garcia (Beyond Buildings) had also prepared an updated Historic Resources Survey report for the John Howard House, dated August 25, 2021, which is used in this report.

Disclaimers

This report addresses the project plans in terms of historically compatible design of the exterior. The Consultant has not undertaken and will not undertake an evaluation or report on the structural conditions or other related safety hazards that might or might not exist at the site and building, and will not review the proposed project for soundness or other safety concerns.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

Character of the Existing Resource

The residence located at 1037 Harrison Street, Santa Clara, CA, was previously evaluated for historic significance, as part of a multiple-property submission (The Harrison Street Block) on September 22, 1980 and listed on the City of Santa Clara's inventory of Architecturally or Significantly Properties. The property underwent an updated Historic Resource Survey (August 25, 2021) to re-evaluate the historic significance of the building, in order to determine if the residence still qualified as an historically significant property. The updated survey and evaluation consisted of a records search, a field survey, research on the history and context of the property use, an evaluation for significance using criteria of the National Register of Historic Places, the California Register of Historical Resources and the City of Santa Clara Criteria for Local Significance, with recordation of the property on California Department of Parks and Recreation DPR523 series forms as the John Howard House. These forms provide summary information about the property within a standard recording format, as well as supplementary photographs. The DPR523 forms were prepared in accordance with the most recent edition of guidelines published by the California State Office of Historic Preservation Instructions for Recording Historical Resources.

In the original 1980 Historic Resources Survey Report (HRSR), 1037 Harrison Street is not individually described but in the updated 2021 HRSR it is. Designated the John Howard House it is described as a Shingle residence. The updated HRSR points out that this “was an unusually free-form and variable style defined mainly by its shingle cladding.”

Constructed in 1892, the John Howard House was originally erected in a local interpretation of this architectural style as a single-family, 1,274 sq. ft., two and one-half story house, wood-framed, residence, clad in “narrow wooden bevel siding with a kick at the base on the main floor, while simple horizontal wood siding sheathes the basement level” and “wooden square butt shingles sheath the home’s gambrel and gable faces.” It is also recorded in that updated HRSR that as “is typical of shingle houses, the walls are uninterrupted at the corners (no corner boards” and that the house has a “two-story extension at the rear, which has “bevel siding with no kick at the base on the main floor level and simple horizontal wood siding on the basement level.”

The updated August, 2021 HRSR notes the house is slightly offset on a 5,740 sq. ft. lot and that it was “designed in an asymmetrical plan with an irregular roof line, typical of a Shingle style home.” The HRSR records that it “has a prominent side-facing (east-west) gambrel roof (one of the Shingle style five principle sub-types) that is punctuated by a subordinate, centered, hipped roof that projects from its north slope towards the rear and a small front-facing gable roof” and that “the gable roof is set over a full-height square bay. that projects from the front.” An eyebrow dormer is set into the gambrel roof’s steepest slope opposite the gable roof. It notes that that “characteristic of this architectural style, the eaves are set close to the wall, so as not to distract from the shingle wall covering” and that “A brick fireplace chimney projects through the slope of the gambrel roof.” The updated August 25, 2021 HRSR further notes that, “A lower, smaller, hipped roof covers [the] two-story extension that projects from a portion of the home’s rear-elevation.”

It is pointed out in the updated HRSR form that “Porches in Shingle houses were integrated into the overall design rather than built as separate attachments” and records that the “front porch of this house was designed in this manner, set under the main roof line and partially absorbed into the body of the house, typical of this style.” The updated HRSR notes that “roof over the porch is supported by two column-like posts with rounded arch openings on either side” and is as originally constructed.

According to the updated HRSR, the windows found on this residence are “mainly of simple one-over-one, vertically orientated, wood-framed windows” on the main level of the side elevations, with Architrave trim found on top of each window. The basement windows are simpler and multi-paned. Those on the porch, bay, gable face and each of the faces of the gambrel roof are far more decorative and exhibit the type of elaborations that can be found in Shingle-style homes. They are all original. However, as noted in the updated HRSR, the “windows on the rear two-story projection are not original and appear to be vinyl-clad, sliding windows.”

The main level of the front-facing full height square bay, which is set under the gable roof, is original. However, the basement level was altered when, prior to 1979 a portion of basement was “converted to a garage with an “opening for the garage door cut into front façade’s basement wall.” While this alteration somewhat diminished the architectural integrity of this structure, the updated HRSR points out that “it is reversible.”

Along with identifying the garage door and rear window alterations to the building, the updated HRSR also records that the front door is a replacement and the three rear entry doors are not original, nor are the rear steps and landing.

In conclusion, the August 25, 2021 HRSR points out that “the property is in good condition and with the exception of alteration to the rear windows and stairs and the addition of a garage in the basement level, appears to have had minimal to no external alteration since its construction in 1892.

Positioned near the middle of the block on the northside of Harrison Street, the subject home is located on a portion of Block 4 North, Range 1 West, framed by Lewis, Washington, Harrison and Main Streets, which was developed from 1891 to the mid-1890s. The updated 2021 HRSR records that “Known as the Harrison Street Block, this group of seven homes consists of one-and-one-half to three story variations of the architectural styles popular during this period; Queen Anne, Stick, Eastlake, and Shingle. All are neatly tied together through the use of similar materials and scale.”

The updated HRSR references the fact that, constructed by the noted contractor and builder Zibeon O. Field, this property is one of the block’s original homes and that “its shingle sheathing and its gambrel roof provide a strong symbolic and visual appeal as a rare example in Santa Clara of an 1890s Shingle style residence. It also points out that the, form, massing and sheathing of both the main body of the house and roof at 1037 Harrison Street and that of the neighboring house at 1025 Harrison Street are identical.

In its evaluation of 1037 Harrison Street, the updated 2021 HRSR records that “located within Santa Clara’s ‘Old Quad’ area, the neighborhood in which the residence at 1037 Harrison Street was constructed was described in 1892 as “the ‘handsomest residential block in Santa Clara.’ Exhibiting housing built in the last decade of the 19th century, which has been basically unchanged for over 120

years, the Harrison Street Block is undoubtedly one of the most historically important in the City of Santa Clara. As the 1979 Historic American Building Survey made of the Harrison Street Block states: "These seven Harrison Street residences [from 1009 to 1091 Harrison Street] are the oldest continuous block of houses in the City of Santa Clara which have not been significantly altered... A picturesque and harmonious streetscape is provided by these eclectic wooden residences which mix stylistic characteristics ~ the Queen Anne, Eastlake, Stick and Shingle idioms. Variegated shingles, decorative bargeboards, scrolled brackets and incised ornamentation reflect the heyday of intricate millwork and the influence of pattern books. In the 1890s and well into the 1920s, this block on Harrison Street was always considered one of the finest, where the leading merchants and tradesmen lived. The street has basically retained its integrity ... Much of the original architectural ambiance of the street has been carefully preserved by house owners."

In its evaluation of 1037 Harrison Street, the updated HPSR found that, as a whole the Harrison Street Block appears eligible for listing as a National Register of Historic Places District. Specific to the subject property, the updated HRSR summarized that due to its architectural style, "the residence at 1037 Harrison Street does "embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction" and "represent[s] a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction" and does contribute to a potentially eligible Historic District" and that "therefore, it does appear that the building may be eligible for the National Register of Historic Places under Criterion C." It also found that "Based on its rare architectural style it appears to reach the level of significance necessary to be eligible individually for the California Register under Criterion 3" and that under the City of Santa Clara's Criteria for Local Significance of A. (Historical or Cultural significance), B. (Architectural significance) and C. (Geographic significance), as of the time of the 2021 evaluation retained its eligibility for listing locally as a Architecturally or Historically Significant property.

All seven of the homes on this Harrison Street block face, from Washington to Main Streets were constructed between 1891 and 1893. All maintain their original configuration and integrity from the time of their construction and are currently listed on the City of Santa Clara's list of Architecturally and/or Historically Significant Properties. The August 25, 2021 HRSR found that due to the fact that no significant changes to either the residence or its lot configuration have occurred since its construction in 1892, "this residence's architectural style, form and massing and character-defining details are all compatible with the neighboring and historic homes on this block, making it an essential contributor to the block's historic integrity."

Summary of the Proposed Project

As shown on the preliminary plans by Xueman Jiang, dated August 8, 2021 the proposed project for the John Howard House consists of replacement of the foundation and alteration to the rear, or secondary elevation of the building to accommodate the conversion of the basement and attic to add 1,994 sq. ft. of additional living space. There will be no external alterations made to either the front façade or east and west elevations of the main house or the home's original gambrel roof, the alterations will be confined to both the main/living and basement levels of the home's rear (north) façade, the offset two-story rear projection and rear of the home's original hip roof. These include the removal of the exterior rear stairs and landing (built 2016) and the main/living level exterior door (not original), which provides access

into the house from the rear projection, modification of windows, which are not original, modification of the basement level entry door in the rear of the main house and the addition of new windows and doors including the addition of a new window in the main/living level. Alteration of the original hip roof will result from the construction of a large shed roofed dormer that will project from the hip roof, towards the rear yard and alley. The project involves the following proposed items:

1. Replacement of the foundation.
2. Replacement of the basement floor in order to increase ceiling height.
3. Removal of rear exterior wood stairs and landing.
4. Conversion of existing garage space in basement to create additional 1274 sq. ft. of living space. Exterior alterations at the basement level will include replacement of the non-original wood-framed entry door, located at the rear façade of the main house at the basement level, with new 10'6" x 6'8" glass sliding patio doors along with construction of a new 2'8" x 6'8" French door and a 4' x 6'8" glass sliding patio door in the two-story rear projection's west elevation. The existing non-original wood-framed entry door opening into the rear elevation of the two-story rear projection's basement level will be replaced with a 2'8" French door with a new 5' x 6' picture window constructed adjacent to the door. Trim on the proposed new doors and windows to match the 4" flat wood trim, which exists on the current ones (which are not original).
5. Exterior alterations at the main/living level include removal of the non-original rear entry stairs and landing and rear door, which provide entry into the main/living level of the two-story rear projection with a new 2'8" x 4' picture window and new siding placed into the previous door opening. A new 4' x 4' sliding window will be constructed in the rear of the main/living level of the main house, which currently is unbroken by any openings. Trim on the proposed new doors and windows to match the 4" flat wood trim, which exists on the current ones (which are not original).
6. Addition of 720 sq. ft. of living space in attic "Loft" area requiring construction of new shed dormer in rear face of hipped roof. Siding for proposed new dormer to match existing rear siding. Addition of 96" x 60," 4-paned sliding window in dormer's rear-facing elevation. Window trim to be 4" flat wood trim.

SECRETARY'S STANDARDS REVIEW:

Analysis

1. **"A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships. "**

Analysis:

No change in the property's historic use is contemplated. Originally constructed as a single-family residential property, the John Howard House will continue to be used as a single-family residence.

2. **"The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided."**

Analysis:

In the proposed project, items 1 and 2 are restoration/renovation projects. The replacement of the foundation preserves the property and the increase in the basement height is strictly internal. Item 3 involves the removal of the non-original exterior wood stairs and landing at the rear of the two-story projection that provide to the main/living level. Their current location appears to not be the original location of the rear stairs. Item 4 consists of renovation projects affecting the home's basement level. These include replacement a non-original wood door with a new glass sliding door in the basement level of the main body of the home's basement level, which will involve enlarging the opening. A new glass French door and a glass sliding patio door will be placed in the west side-elevation of the two-story projection in what is currently solid wall space. The non-original wood door in the rear of the two-story projection will be replaced with a glass French door and a new picture window will be constructed adjacent to it, in what is currently solid wall space. Item 5. Consists of projects affecting the home's main living level (2nd-story). A new sliding window will be inserted into what is currently solid wall space in the main body of the house. The non-historic door located in the two-story projection at the top of the exterior stairs, will be removed and the opening filled with a new picture window and new siding. Items 4 and 5 involve the replacement of non-historic doors along with the construction of 2 new doors and two new windows into what is currently solid wall space. Both of the latter will involve some removal of original historic siding. The insertion of the window into the main/living level removes original narrow bevel siding, which is a distinctive material that characterizes this level of the property. Items 3-5 only remove a minimal amount of distinctive historic materials (original siding) and affect the rear or secondary elevation of the building. The historic character of the property as viewed from the street will be retained and the alterations will not cause visual impacts to the features, spaces and spatial relationships that historically characterize the property. **See Appendix A, Photos 1, 2 and 3.**

Item 6 involves construction of a new shed dormer in rear face of building's rear hipped roof to allow for the addition of living space in the attic "Loft" area, along with a 4-paned sliding window in dormer's rear-facing elevation. The addition of a new shed dormer will alter a portion of the roof and result in the alteration of the distinctive roof form that characterizes the property. While not visible from the street, it will be highly visible from the alley that runs behind the Harrison Street properties on this block. **See Appendix A, Photos 4, 5 and 6.**

3. **"Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken."**

Analysis:

No changes are contemplated that would create a false sense of historical development.

4. **"Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved."**

Analysis:

No changes to the building that have acquired historic significance in their own right are contemplated.

5. **"Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved."**

Analysis:

The proposed project will preserve the distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize the property.

6. **"Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence."**

Analysis:

No historic features are proposed to be replaced. "Non-historic" doors will be removed and replaced with new with new and different doors. If necessary to replace the siding on patched areas, the siding will be similar to the original materials as substantiated by the physical evidence existing in the building's original construction.

7. **"Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used."**

Analysis:

No chemical treatments will be undertaken that will cause damage to historic materials.

8. **"Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken."**

Analysis:

Archaeological resources are not evaluated in this report.

9. **"New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials,**

features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment."

Analysis:

Items 3 through 6 involve alteration of the rear or secondary façade and related new construction. As shown on the plans dated 08/08/21, E. Rear Elevation (Northwest) and Proposed Rear Elevation (Northwest), E. Left Elevation (Southwest) and Proposed Left Elevation (Southwest), the alterations proposed for the rear façade of the main house include the replacement of a non-original wood entry door with sliding patio doors at the basement level and the construction of a window into the rear of the main/living level, which is currently an unbroken wall. Those proposed for the west and rear elevations of the hipped roof two-story projection, include the removal of this projection's stairs landing, and entry door into the main/living level and insertion of a picture window into part of the space once occupied by the entry door, replacement of a non-original wood entry door with a glass French door into part of the basement level and construction of a large picture window adjacent to the door in what is currently an unbroken wall, along with construction of two new entry doors in the projection's west side elevation's basement level. Also proposed is the creation of a new shed-roofed dormer with a sliding window in the rear face of the original hipped roof. **See Appendix B.**

Item 3 proposes removing the exterior rear stairs and landing that provide access to an entry door opening into the main/living level of the rear projection. These are not original (rebuilt in 2016). Also, the location of the exterior stairs appears to have at some time been moved from the original site of the rear entry stairs. Removing the stairs and landing will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. **See Appendix A. Photo 1.**

Item 4. The replacement of the two non-original wood entry doors with new glass doors along with the construction of two new glass doors and a new picture window in the rear of the basement level of the main house and the two-story projection will only minimally destroy historic basement siding on the lowest level on a secondary (rear) elevation. **See Appendix A. Photos 1, 2, and 3.**

Item 5. As proposed, the placement of a new 2'8" x 4' picture window and new compatible siding into the previous door opening utilizes the space once occupied by the non-original rear door that provided access to the main/living level of the two-story rear projection and will not destroy historic materials or features that characterize the property. **See Appendix A. Photo 1.**

However, a new 4' x 4' sliding window is proposed to be constructed in the rear of the main/living level of the main house, which currently is unbroken by any openings. The removal of original narrow bevel siding on the main/living level to insert the window will destroy historic material. While currently the non-original windows on the two-story rear projection are sliding windows, this new 4' x 4' sliding window in the main/living level of the body of the house will not be compatible with the original, historic, vertically orientated, wood-framed double-hung window style that exists on this level of the house's front and side elevations. **See Appendix A, Photo 3.**

Item 6. The shed roofed dormer proposed to be constructed in the rear face of the main house's original hipped roof in order to allow creation of a "Loft" or livable space in the attic, will be a compatible feature, as a shed -roofed dormer is a typical dormer for this architectural style. It will have horizontal siding that is compatible with the original horizontal siding of the house however, the sliding window is not a compatible window style as these dormers typically had a row of individual windows. **See Appendix A, Photo 4.**

The home has a prominent side-facing (east-west) gambrel roof (one of the Shingle style five principle sub-types) that is punctuated by a subordinate, centered, hipped roof that projects from its north slope towards the rear. The new addition of a dormer in the rear face of the original hipped roof will destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the historic roof form and does create a visual impact to the historic property. However, this impact is almost completely limited to a secondary elevation (the rear or north facade). While it will be fully visible from the alley, it will have only a slight visibility (if any) from Harrison Street. **See Appendix A, Photo 5.**

Currently the John Howard House is located in the middle (no. 3) of a row of seven houses constructed in 1891-94 and that is the only area in the City of Santa Clara important enough to be included in the National Park Service's Historic American Building Survey. The seven Harrison Street residences on the north side of the block (1009 to 1091), located between Washington and Jackson Streets with an alley that runs behind them, are the oldest continuous block of houses in the City, which have not had their original form or massing significantly altered.

The subject historic property is bordered on the east property line by an unmodified residence constructed at the same time as this one and the form, massing and materials on both the main body of the house and the roof on this building and the neighboring house are identical. The addition of a shed roof dormer in the rear face of the subject historic property's original rear hipped roof will alter that identical appearance and thus impact the integrity of the immediate environment. **See Appendix A, Photo 6.**

10. "New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in a such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired."

Analysis:

The new shed-roofed dormer proposed to be constructed in the rear of the building's rear facing hipped roof would be able to be removed in the future with no impairment to the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment.

Evaluation Summary of the Proposed Project

The Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation define "Rehabilitation" as "the process of returning a property to a state of utility, through repair or alteration, which makes possible an efficient

contemporary use while preserving those portions and features of the property which are significant to its historic, architectural, and cultural values." In other words, the Standards recognize that at least some repair or alteration of the historic building will be needed in order to provide for an efficient contemporary use; however, these repairs and alterations must not damage or destroy materials, features or finishes that are important in defining the building's historic character.

The evaluator finds that in line with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, as analyzed above, the proposed project for the property at 1037 Harrison Street does appear to "make possible an efficient contemporary use and while there will be alteration to some materials and features, those portions and features of the property that are significant to its historic, architectural and cultural values," will be preserved.

APPENDIX A

1037 Harrison Street, Santa Clara, CA 95050

NORTH

Alley



1037 Harrison Street

SOUTH

THE HARRISON STREET BLOCK

2021 Google Aerial



Photo 1. View of the rear (north) facade. A - marks the rear exterior stairs and landing proposed for removal. B - marks the wood entry door opening into the main/living level to be removed and replaced with a new 2'8" x 4' picture window and new compatible siding placed into the previous door opening. C - marks the existing non-original wood-framed entry door opening into the rear elevation of the two-story rear projection's basement level. It will be replaced with a 2'8" French door with a new 5' x 6' picture window constructed adjacent to the French door (area covered in photo by staircase).



Photo 2. View of the rear two-story projection's (west) side elevation. Note the two existing non-original sliding windows in the projection's main/living level. A new 2'8" x 6'8" French door and a 4' x 6'8" glass sliding patio door are proposed to be placed in the solid basement level's wall beneath these windows.



Photo 3. View of the main body of the house's rear (north) façade and partial west side elevation showing existing non-original ground level basement entry door to be removed. New 10'6" x 6'8" glass sliding patio doors to be inserted into this space. A new 4' x 4' sliding window is proposed to be constructed in the main/living level, shown currently unbroken by any openings. Note the existing original, historic, vertically orientated, wood-framed double-hung window style that exists on this level of the house as shown on the side elevation.



Photo 4. View of the residence's gambrel roof and hipped roof rear faces and that of the two-story rear projection's smaller hipped roof. A – marks the hipped roofs rear face where the shed roof dormer is proposed to be placed.



Photo 5. View of the residence's rear façade as seen from the alley that runs behind the subject historic property. Note how clearly visible the new shed roof dormer will be when placed in rear face of the main hipped roof.

Photo 6. GOOGLE 2021 AERIAL VIEWS OF 1037 AND 1025 HARRISON Street



These Photos show the existing identical roof forms on the main body of the two adjacent houses. The proposed shed-roofed dormer for the “Loft” will project from the rear face of the large hipped roof that projects from the rear of the gambrel roof on 1037 Harrison St.



marks the rear of 1037 Harrison Street on the above photos.

APPENDIX B

Preliminary plans, dated August 8, 2021
Existing and Proposed elevations



