



Agenda Report

21-435

Agenda Date: 4/1/2021

REPORT TO HISTORICAL AND LANDMARKS COMMISSION

SUBJECT

Public Hearing: Consideration of an Architectural Review of a proposed addition at a property located at 1772 Main Street that is within 200 feet of a Historic Resource. (Continued from March 4, 2021 HLC Meeting)

BACKGROUND

The proposed project for an addition to the main house and the new garage was heard by the Historical and Landmarks Commission (HLC) on March 4, 2021 in accordance with the Historic Preservation Ordinance, which requires all properties within 200 feet of an HRI property proposing ground floor expansion with four bedrooms or more be referred to this Commission. The subject property is not currently listed as a historic resource but is within 200 feet of a property listed on Historical Resource Inventory (HRI) at 1795 Main Street.

The discussion primarily centered around the proposed garage to the front, which as proposed would be adversely impact a potential historic structure and inconsistent with the overall rhythm and development pattern along Main Street. Comments from the Historical Advisors also recommended relocation of the garage to the rear. They further suggested that the proposed addition should not compete with the main house and should be set back further to have less visibility from the street. Two members of the public spoke in favor of relocating the garage to the rear. After further deliberation, the Commission directed staff to work with the applicants and HLC Architectural Advisor Craig Mineweaser to update the design, including detaching the garage and repositioning it at the rear of the property.

The staff report from March 4, 2021 and the letters from the Historical Advisors are available as Attachment 1 and Attachment 2. The revised development plans incorporating the comments are available as Attachment 7 with this report. As the project scope would result in a five-bedroom four-bathroom residence, it will require approval at a Development Review Hearing following the HLC review.

DISCUSSION

The revised proposal would add 989 square feet of habitable space to the west side of the existing 1,290 square feet one-story house and 322 square feet detached garage to the rear.

The proposed addition is set back approximately ten feet from the existing structure to minimize the impact on the existing front façade. While the project involves substantial interior remodel, it maintains the existing front façade including the 69 square feet front porch, front door, and the window openings. The existing residence has three bedrooms and one bathroom on the first floor. It also has two potentially non-conforming or unpermitted bedrooms and a half bath in the basement. The City does not have any record of this conversion of the basement to habitable space, therefore,

these bedrooms are considered a new addition and part of the current proposal. The proposed project adds a family room and a new master bedroom and relocates the existing kitchen on the first floor resulting in a total first floor habitable area of 2,279 square feet. No expansion is proposed to the existing 511 square feet basement and the project adds a full bath within the existing square footage. The external access to the basement is eliminated to connect the basement internally with the main house. This would prevent the future use of basement as an ADU without permits. Subject to permits and administrative approval, the basement could be converted to an ADU.

The subject property is not listed as an architecturally or historically significant property in the City's Historical Resource Inventory (HRI) but is across the street from an HRI property at 1795 Main Street, and is consistent with other structures of a similar age and architectural design currently included on the HRI. The Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) form for 1795 Main Street is available as Attachment 6. The proposed addition complies with the Single Family Design Guidelines and maintains significant distance from the HRI property.

A decision to recommend approval of the proposed project shall be based upon if the project would meet the intent of the Secretary of the Interior Standard (SIS) Treatment Guidelines as required under CEQA:

- Distinguishing the addition from the original building by setting it back from the wall plane of the historic building.
- Using the same forms, materials, and color range of the historic building in a manner that does not duplicate it but distinguishes the addition from the original building.
- Ensuring that the addition is subordinate and secondary to the historic building and is compatible in massing, scale, materials, relationship of solids to voids, and color.

The proposed addition is set back approximately 10 feet from the existing wall plane. The proposal borrows architectural styles, such as the roof pitch, siding, window proportions from the main house, while using similar materials, simplified trims, different width for the siding to differentiate from the existing structure. The new addition has a lower roof height to appear subordinate to the existing historic structure. The proposed garage has been relocated to the rear as a detached structure. A staff level minor modification would be provided for the size, 322 square-feet where 400 square-feet is required, and rear set back, three feet nine inches where five feet is required, to accommodate the proposed detached garage to the rear. The project as proposed provides an adaptive use of the existing residence.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The proposed project is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per CEQA Guidelines Section 15303-New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures, in that the project is limited to a new addition to the existing single-family residence.

The scope of the proposed addition is exempt from CEQA environmental review requirements per CEQA Section 15331, Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation as the project was found to be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for New Exterior Additions to Historic Buildings.

PUBLIC CONTACT

On February 19, 2021, a notice of public hearing of this item was posted at three conspicuous locations within 300 feet of the project site and mailed to property owners within 300 feet of the project site. The project was continued at the HLC meeting on March 4, 2021 to the next scheduled meeting on April 1, 2021. No public comments have been received at the time of preparation of this report.

RECOMMENDATION

There is no staff recommendation.

Prepared by: Nimisha Agrawal, Associate Planner

Approved by: Gloria Sciara, Development Review Officer

ATTACHMENTS

1. Staff Report March 4, 2021
2. Letters from Historical Advisors March 4, 2021
3. Project Data Sheet
4. Applicant's Statement of Justification
5. Conditions of Approval
6. DPR Form- 1795 Main Street
7. Development Plans